Poverty and Ethnic Minorities in Strathclyde

...A literature review

Jacqueline Bain **Kay Hampton**

Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit

Research paper, Number 3 Series Two

ISSN 0957 9028

August 1995

GLASGOW CALEDONIAN UNIVERSITY

SCOTTISH ETHNIC MINORITIES RESEARCH UNIT

Poverty and Ethnic Minorities in Strathclyde

... A literature review

Report submitted to: Strathclyde Poverty Alliance

Researchers: Jacqueline Bain and Kay Hampton

SEMRU

August 1995

Contents

	Page
Preface	2
Introduction	3
Section One: Definitions...	5
Section Two: Ethnicity and Poverty...	8
Employment...	9
Self Employment...	11
Welfare benefits...	12
Higher education and training...	14
Housing...	16
Health...	22
Section Three:Concluding remarks...	27
Key Observations...	28
Future Developmental Work...	30
Bibliography...	32

Preface

This report is based on a review of literature commissioned by the Strathclyde Poverty Alliance. The review is a continuation of previous, related work undertaken by the Alliance (Strathclyde Poverty Alliance 1994). The primary aim of the review was to uncover current and related literature on poverty and ethnic minorities, particularly in Strathclyde and to place this within the broader context of poverty in Scotland.

The review involved a library search and an evaluation of related documented work on ethnic minorities in Scotland and, indeed Britain. The main task of the researchers was to organise published material relating to poverty and to provide an outline of current issues relating to poverty and ethnic minorities in Strathclyde. Subsequently, although certain observations may reflect the views of the authors, the substance of this compilation must be seen essentially as the work of others.

On the basis of this review, some suggestions are offered to the Alliance, for consideration in future development work.

A Note on Terminology

For the purpose of this study, the terms "ethnic minority", "minority groups" and "black and ethnic minorities" are used to refer to 'people of colour', mainly of African/Caribbean, Chinese and Asian (Indian, Pakistani & Bangladeshi) descent.

Introduction

The general focus of most British and especially Scottish, literature on poverty has been largely colour-blind. Amin and Oppenheim (1992) concur that social policy research in general, has paid scant attention to issues of 'race' and as a result ethnic minority poverty is subsumed under overall poverty in the population as a whole. Craig (1994) concurs that in general, measuring poverty in Scotland is problematic as most statistical data tends to examine the UK as a whole, and generally does not directly address poverty in Scotland per se.

While certain aspects of poverty may be similarly experienced by both white and ethnic communities, many researchers argue that poverty is not even-handed. The way in which poverty is experienced by ethnic minorities may be more acute, as deprivation is compounded by discrimination, exclusion and isolation (Amin and Oppenheim 1992). These and other such fundamental issues which affect poverty among ethnic minorities remain unclear and importantly, most poverty strategies and policies that are targeted at the general population are often not entirely relevant to the ethnic minority communities.

Recognising the limited and fragmented nature of documented research on ethnic minorities and poverty, the present review attempts to co-ordinate evidence relating especially to the experiences of ethnic minorities in Scotland. The material selected during this exercise and its treatment reflects the main aims of this project and its intention to assist in the development of the Poverty Alliances' work. More specifically, the main aims of the project were:

- to gather and review existing material on poverty and ethnic minorities in Scotland, particularly Strathclyde.
- to identify links between poverty and other related issues such as low pay, employment and living conditions (housing and health) by using previous studies that had focussed on ethnic minority communities.
- to place this within a context of poverty in Scotland, considering factors such as institutional racism, discrimination and cultural perceptions which may impact directly on ethnic minority communities and their quality of life
- to recommend strategies for future research and developmental work.

These aims were met by two main methods, the first of which was a review of literature to date, principally relating to Scotland, but also where relevant, including other parts of the UK. This involved a general library search using the University's Dynix System, CD Rom, J.A.N.E.T. and B.I.D.S. systems. The second method involved a review of existing SEMRU publications and other local material on ethnic minorities in Scotland. A number of local studies, although not directly aimed at poverty, have indicated strong evidence of poverty and deprivation amongst Strathclydes' ethnic minority communities. These studies were mainly in the area of health, housing, employment, gender and child care, public services and discrimination. In addition, external voluntary and statutory bodies were contacted to determine the level of information available.

The remainder of this report is set out in three sections. Section 1 deals with the definition of poverty, Section 2 focuses on ethnicity and poverty, highlighting the main issues that effect poverty and Section 3 offers concluding remarks and some suggestions for future developmental work.

Section One: Definitions...

> *" ...it is a relative rather than absolute; it is essentially qualitative rather than quantitative; it is to a certain extent subjective rather than objective; it refers to the general condition of man rather than a specific facet of his existence..."* (Lampman 1971)

It is difficult to provide an objective definition of poverty and over the years, poverty has been described in various ways by different researchers. Poverty has often been defined in ways that refer to an insufficiency in the material necessities of life and an inadequate standard of living (Clinard 1974). A key factor in the debate over the extent of poverty has been the distinction between absolute and relative poverty (Pacione 1989). The absolutist definition, as maintained by Clinard is derived from Rowntrees' (1901) work and is based on the notion of minimum level of subsistence and the related concept of a poverty line.

More recently, it has been argued that needs are culturally and socially determined, rather than biologically fixed and as such, poverty should be viewed as a relative phenomenon. The broader definition of needs inherent in the concept of relative poverty include job security, work satisfaction, use and access to public services as well as satisfaction of higher order needs such as status, power and self-esteem. Pacione (1989) explains this view by summarising Townsends' (1989) perspective **"...individuals, families and groups in the population can be said to be in poverty when they lack the resources to obtain the types of diet, participate in the activities and have the living conditions and amenities which are customary, or at least widely encouraged or approved, in the societies to which they belong..."**

The proponents of the relative poverty perspective argue therefore that poverty must be defined relative to the prevailing living standards in a society; poverty is not just about survival but about social needs too. (Save the Children 1994). Referring to the work of Kirk et al (1991) and Stirling Resource Centre (1992) Craig (1994) acknowledges that absolute poverty as a term used to describe outright destitution can only be applied to a limited number of people, and relative poverty is a more meaningful concept as it allows for differences between groups in terms of access to income and wealth.

A third dimension to the debate is the recognition that poverty is regionally

variable. It has been acknowledged by many since the 1930s that the experience of poverty and deprivation could be regionally variable (Levitt in Brown & Cook 1983) and as recently as 1994, the European Community stated, that it was important to recognise that living standards differed between countries, and that material deprivation was related to social and cultural exclusion (Save the Children 1994). Although, the importance of evaluating poverty in Scotland as a region has been recognised, the multi-cultural nature of Scottish communities and its implications have not been fully considered. This points to an assumption that all communities in Scotland experience poverty in the same way and to the same extent. On the contrary, there is growing evidence that people from ethnic minority communities are at greater risk of experiencing poverty than members of the indigenous population, due to wider discrimination in society as a whole, with race being a crucial indicator of poverty (Amin & Oppenheim 1992).

In the absence of an official definition of poverty and given the exploratory nature of this review, the researchers felt it necessary to include evidence relating to both the absolute and relative aspects of poverty. The researchers thus looked at a number of different indicators (income, employment, housing and health) to try and build up a picture of poverty amongst ethnic minorities in Scotland. In particular, relative definitions of poverty prove more useful when utilised in relation to ethnic minority needs as they take poverty beyond biological needs such as food, water, clothing and shelter, to a wider spectrum of material deprivation, social exclusion and cultural experience, variable over time and between societies.

The relative definition of poverty has particular implications for ethnic minority populations in Scotland since various cultural factors (for example, religious obligation, extended family obligations, the obligation to support families overseas, family status, the obligation to host traditional ceremonies and provide gifts at traditional ceremonies) influence the quality of life and daily living circumstances of most ethnic minority households. This analysis allows for such issues to be examined and how this renders ethnic minority communities more susceptible to poverty, and a lower quality of living standard.

Poverty in Scotland today must be placed not only within a context of the worldwide recession which has had drastic effects on the Scottish economy, but also in relation to the present day government's ideological emphasis on the individual being responsible for social and economic well-being, culminating in the withdrawal of the welfare state. This approach fails to recognise distinct patterns of disadvantage, placing an added burden on people to 'prove' their poverty. The welfare policies of the post war period failed to adequately address the problems of poverty and deprivation, and therefore they remain the daily

experience of many people in the United Kingdom (Pacione 1989).

Whilst there appears to be no standard definition of the term, it has been increasingly accepted that poverty represents inequality in living standards, and is not solely connected to income and money, but can in fact be linked to a number of other factors like limited access to housing, health care, education and employment (Norris 1977), which can impact on people in a number of differing ways. This it will be noted later has severe implications for ethnic minority communities.

Given that a family's living standards may be affected by access to housing, medical services and welfare rights, poverty can therefore be experienced and perceived differently by various groups. In recent years, many local organisations (Strathclyde Regional Council 1990; Glasgow District Council 1992; Strathclyde Poverty Alliance 1992) have recognised this issue and have advanced a variety of anti-poverty strategies and policies, aimed at combatting poverty and its effects on the quality of life of certain sectors within Scottish society.

Section 2: Ethnicity and Poverty in Scotland...

Amin and Oppenheim (1992) assert that there is ample evidence that members of ethnic minorities are more likely than white people to be low-paid and that they have suffered a decade of persistently higher unemployment. Referring to the situation in Britain, they maintain that generally minority groups' economic displacement of recent years has been accompanied by poor housing, increasing homelessness and run-down schools. Similarly Pacione (1989) points out that in Scotland, the complex of poverty related problems such as poor housing, increased rates of family breakdown, increased mortality, homelessness and mental illness have shown to exhibit a spatial concentration in particular parts of the inner city areas where most ethnic minorities tend to reside.

In Scotland, the lack of knowledge of the social and economic requirements and circumstances of ethnic minority groups, entwined with the limited understanding of race relations have impacted negatively on the lives and opportunities of ethnic minority communities. Even though the ethnic minority communities now form a sizable (64 000) and established part of the Scottish population, comprising mainly those of Pakistani (42%), Indian (19%) and Chinese (15%) origin, the socio-economic background, composition and life circumstances of ethnic minority groups have not been fully accommodated by wider research and policy making bodies.

For example, much of the analysis, in terms of social class and employment of Scottish ethnic minority communities derives from the 1991 census which had for the first time, introduced an ethnic question. This data has proved extremely useful but is fraught with limitations and does little to identify the needs of ethnic minority groups, or the extent to which poverty is experienced within these groups in Scotland.

Employment, unemployment and low pay...

Unemployment...

Many researchers agree that unemployment, low pay and inadequate social security are some of the more direct causes of poverty. (Amin and Oppenheim 1992, Pacione 1989, Save The Children & GCU 1995). Pacione (1989) points out that these factors lie at the root of most social problems and should therefore be the main target for those seeking to alleviate urban deprivation.

Within Scotland, poverty caused by unemployment has a regional, and therefore an urban or rural dimension and indeed, the national trend will to some extent mirror the unemployment trends within ethnic communities. For example, whilst in 1992, the Shetland and Grampian regions had the lowest unemployment rates, Strathclyde and the Western Isles experienced the highest rates (Save The Children & GCU 1995). Pacione (1989) confirms this pattern by indicating that a recent study which analysed levels of deprivation in all enumeration districts in Scotland, found the Strathclyde region to have a disproportionately large share of Scotland's most deprived districts. Among the most deprived districts were Glasgow and the Clydeside conurbation (Monklands, Motherwell, Hamilton, Renfrew and Dumbarton). Given that the majority of the ethnic minorities reside in the Strathclyde region and indeed in Glasgow (21 517), unemployment trends within these communities must invariably be effected by the overall regional pattern.

Save the Children (1994) in their Poverty Briefing confirm that not only was the ethnic population in the Strathclyde region affected by the regional trend, but that the unemployment rate for these communities were substantially more than that of the white population. For example they indicate that in Strathclyde, while the unemployment rate was 13.33% for the white population in 1991, it was much higher (16.89%) for the ethnic groups. Further, they refer to a Scottish Office survey (conducted : 1988/89) which showed that the male ethnic minority rate (19%) was higher than that of their white counterparts (14%) as was the female at 21% and 10 % respectively. Although the gap in Scotland between ethnic minority and white employment is less marked than in England it is nevertheless still quite substantial.

Low pay...

In addition to unemployment, any discussion of poverty or the poor must include those low paid workers whose income is insufficient to provide a decent standard of living (Pacione 1989). In referring to this group, Pacione maintains that they are the **"reserve army of workers"** who are more likely to become unemployed and less likely to enjoy fringe benefits such as sick pay, old age pensions and other such benefit schemes. In this regard, Save The Children & GCU (1995) point out that **"ethnic minority employees are concentrated in some of the lowest paid kinds of work".** For example they point out that over 45% of all male ethnic minority employees and 47% of all female employees work in the combined category of **"hotel, catering, distribution and repairs"** compared to 11% and 23% of their white counterparts.

On a more localised level, McFarland & Walsh (1989) undertook an empirical study during which they interviewed 50 ethnic minority youths in the Woodlands area, one of the highest ethnic minority concentrations in Scotland. They found that half of their sample were in low paid, part-time employment, with little opportunity for training or career development. The unemployment rate for ethnic minority females was extremely high. Of those who were in work, most were economically active in independent retailing which has had declining fortunes since the end of World War Two, and had been badly hit, more so by the recent recession.

In an in-depth analysis of the Labour Force in the United Kingdom, Sly (1994) found many variations between ethnic minority groups and social class. Nearly two-thirds of the Indian men were in non-manual occupations, compared to two-fifths of black and Pakistani men. Further, larger proportions of Indian men were in professional jobs compared to Pakistani men. The study also found that economic activity rates were lower for most ethnic minority groups, especially the Pakistani and Bangladeshi.

The employment situation of ethnic minorities is further compounded by poor access to jobs and training which has a profound bearing on the quality of work obtained by ethnic minority communities. This is clearly illustrated by Save the Children in their Poverty Brief, who state that:

"Throughout Scotland you'll find black people who are trained pharmacists, doctors, accountants, lawyers. You'll meet them in the shops and restaurants where they work. You are effectively ghettoised in the race relations industry or self-employment in Scotland."

Amin & Oppenheim (1992) found in their study that many of their respondents felt their access to the labour market was limited both by overt racism and by subtle forms of institutional and structural discrimination; with employers having stereotyped images of what jobs ethnic minorities were suited to, particularly Asian women. The conclusions of an STUC report confirm these findings, asserting that the recession will lead to a further growth in unemployment amongst ethnic minority communities. According to them, the worst hit group in Scotland is the Pakistani community. Based on a Scottish Office study (Sample size: 840 households; areas covered: Glasgow, Edinburgh, Dundee and Aberdeen) in Scotland, the STUC report stated that 24% of Pakistani males and 28% of Pakistani women are out of work. They add also that given the demographic dispersal of ethnic minority workers in Scotland, they suspect that the picture may well be worse than the UK average (STUC 1992).

Amin & Oppenheim (1992) point out that another important factor affecting access to the labour market identified by their respondents was a fear of racial discrimination in the actual place of work and on the streets. A similar notion is supported by a study conducted in Glasgow. Walsh (1987) found that racial harassment was having a detrimental effect on the lives of ethnic minorities in Glasgow, particularly women, who had suffered harassment, verbal abuse, and in some cases physical attacks. Because of this they preferred to stay indoors, only going outwith the community in the company of husbands or friends.

Self -employment...

Given the difficulties experienced in accessing work, many ethnic minorities have turned to self-employment as a means of survival. For example, in a study conducted by Bailey et al (1994) in Scotland, it has been found that the Chinese have an extremely limited range of occupations. In their study, 90% of their Chinese respondents indicated that they were currently employed in family owned catering businesses. Save the Children & GCU (1995) concur that self-employment is much more common in ethnic minority communities than in white communities in Scotland. They point out also, that this should not be seen as a mark of affluence. Mann (in Ridley and Kendrick 1994) maintains that self-employment in the ethnic economic enclave represents an escape route resulting from limited occupational choice, and concluded that it is a disguised form of under-employment and unemployment.

It is therefore accepted by many researchers that self-employment does not present a definite picture of affluence, with 24% of all self-employed people in the United Kingdom falling under the 50% below average income threshold

(Households Below Average Income 1983). Nonetheless, it has been suggested that in the case of the ethnic family, even if a family business is doing well, this may still mean degree of poverty for ethnic women as disposable income tends to be the responsibility of the head of the household, usually the male breadwinner (Avan 1994).

Other similar cultural factors that reduces the family's disposable income are mentioned by various researchers. For example it was pointed out by Avan (1994) that it was commonplace for some ethnic families to have a financial commitment to relatives still living in their country of origin. Success and family status are deemed very important and some families, to highlight this, may purchase land or build a house in their country of origin to gain respect from members of their community. This places obvious strains on the family income.

It was identified in another study (Amin and Oppenheim 1992) that ethnic minority communities experience debt differently as they are more likely to borrow from friends or family, which entails a strong obligation to pay loans back, causing stress and anxiety. Debt in many instances was also related to specific cultural commitments such as family trips abroad and being obliged to provide gifts at weddings and births. The report of the Scottish Office found that 1 in 5 families were sending money to dependents abroad (Smith 1990).

It was also discovered that several Asian families had certain members who had come to Scotland as their dependents, adding financial burdens and stress on the family. Walsh (1987) also expressed concern that unemployment may spread if family businesses are no longer able to support the growing number of Asians dependent on them. In this regard, the relatively smaller Chinese families has meant that Chinese businesses are more able to support their family members (Bailey et al 1994).

Welfare Benefits...

The main ways of measuring poverty in Britain have been by reference to Income Support/Supplementary Benefit level, and by comparing household incomes (Geddes 1995). Glasgow City Council in 1992 discovered that the uptake of means tested benefits by ethnic minority residents in Glasgow was broadly similar to uptake for the city as a whole. There were, however, significant differences in the types of benefits claimed. Only 7% of the city's ethnic minority population received housing benefit compared to the figure of 22% for the whole of Glasgow but 18% of ethnic minority residents received family credit compared to only 1% of the Glasgow population.

Although there is a strong cultural preference for paid work and great stigma attached to unemployment, Amin and Oppenheim (1992) found that many ethnic minority communities tend to be reliant on welfare benefits. This, they maintain is due to the fact that ethnic minorities are more exposed to risks of unemployment and low pay. Some researchers have previously attempted to measure poverty in terms of those claiming welfare benefit (Amin and Oppenheim 1992).

However various issues were uncovered during this review to indicate that this may not be the most reliable method of assessing levels of poverty among ethnic minority communities. Certain factors (for example lack of information, lack of understanding of the benefits system, stigma attached to collecting benefits, language problems, racism, cultural) result in ethnic minorities not claiming or under-claiming benefits and this invariably results in deprivation. Save the Children & GCU (1995) claim that for ethnic minority communities, the problems also faced by those claiming benefit are multiplied due to language problems and racism.

More specifically, in a study carried out by the Social Policy Research Unit in Leeds (1994), it was discovered that ethnic minority perceptions of welfare benefits tend to be negative, and are very much influenced by religious and cultural factors. This prevented many ethnic minorities from claiming benefits even though they were qualified to claim. They also found that in particular, the Bangladeshi, Pakistani, and Chinese communities felt that there was a degree of stigma attached to claiming benefits and some even experienced direct hostility from their families.

Further, Social Policy Research (1994) also found that immigration laws also have an impact on ethnic minority welfare claimants. For example the law denies benefits to some newcomers in Britain who do not qualify for certain sources of public funding such as income support. Therefore they are dependent on their families or friends for financial assistance and this often leads to feelings of loss of control, dignity and personal privacy.

In addition, employment patterns and cultural factors affect rights to contributory and non-contributory benefits. For example, to claim some allowances a 'residence' or 'presence' qualifying period is required. Visits abroad as part of a family obligation means that the person has to requalify. Another disadvantage sometimes experienced by ethnic minorities relates to family credit. In order to qualify for family credit (which is for low paid workers with dependent children, awarded for twenty six weeks at a time), the claimant must work over sixteen

hours a week. This can create difficulties for the self-employed and for those whose salaries fluctuate weekly and subsequently discounts many ethnic minority businesses and those in insecure employment.

More locally, McFarland at al (1987) found that the Asian community in East Pollokshields tended not to make use of welfare services in general, due to a lack of knowledge about what services were available and **"the unhelpful attitudes of some white service providers"**. They argued that assumptions that ethnic minority communities have their own internal modes of support may, in some cases, be true but the study discovered that some of the needs remained unmet because they were outwith the control of the local community, requiring wider welfare support.

The National Association of Citizen's Advice concluded that although many people faced problems in claiming welfare benefits and that for ethnic minority people there were additional barriers related to communication and language. This affected the perceptions of ethnic minority claimants who felt that entitlement to benefits was unequal (Save the Children & GCU 1995). There is evidence to suggest that one of the most significant causes of acute poverty is related to the failure of some people not receiving their full benefits (Pacione 1989). Due to certain difficulties experienced in accessing welfare services, ethnic minority communities are likely to feature highly in this group.

Higher education and training...

Given the youthful age profile of ethnic populations, there is often a desire and strong commitment by most ethnic minority communities to educate their children and allow them better access to jobs. It has been established that Muslim mothers in Scotland generally regarded higher education for their daughters as crucial, and that education is among many interlinked variables that contribute to a family's honour (Knox & Siann 1994). This growing commitment to accessing higher education is to some extent also contributing to deprivation in many ethnic families.

Access to higher and further education is not always easy for ethnic minority communities in Scotland, as various researchers argue that ethnic minority students face numerous barriers in this regard. (Vellins 1982, Bird at al 1988, CRE 1992, Panesar 1995). In 1992, the CRE (Commission for Racial Equality) concluded that some ethnic minority students have a different and inferior experience of higher education than their white peers. In particular, the admissions procedures has, in the past five years, come under scrutiny and has been identified as a

major barrier to ethnic minorities entering higher education (CRE 1987, 1988, 1992).

Bird et al (1988) disclosed a number of barriers which hindered access to and progression through higher education: a lack of interaction between schools and universities, a lack of accessible information, the admissions process, the curriculum content, and a general feeling of isolation. There was a general feeling that the barriers impacted negatively on ethnic minorities experience of higher education. Vellins (1982) identified other barriers such as attendance at poor schools, cultural conflict, lack of fluency in English and racial discrimination.

In a study of Asian women Panesar (1995) identified a number of barriers that hindered Asian women: the women did not know where to get educational guidance and therefore were unsure of career choices. Further, pressures of marriage, stereotyped notions of Asian women by careers advisers, concerns about the English language, financial problems, and bad experiences at school also proved to be barriers.

In addition, the recent cuts in grants and removal of student's benefits rights has led to widespread deprivation amongst the student population and greater reliance on families for financial support. This has created distinct class divisions with children from social classes 4 and 5 being less likely to progress through the higher education system (Pearson et al 1989). Though figures are not available specifically for ethnic minority students, the data collated must be seen to include those of ethnic minority origin.

Despite a cultural commitment to higher and further education, current employment prospects for most ethnic minority graduates are poor. Increasing unemployment, segregation in low paid and insecure jobs are commonly experienced. The labour market has, in recent years, undergone major restructuring with an increase in low paid, part-time, insecure work. It has been suggested that many young ethnic minority people may be sheltering from discrimination in the labour market by staying on at school or in higher education given that ethnic minority youth have been disproportionally affected by unemployment and poor access to the labour market.

Sly (1994) concurs that higher education qualifications do not appear to give the ethnic minority population the same advantages as the white in the labour market. Brennan and McGeever (1990) argue in a similar vein pointing out that ethnic minority graduates perceive ethnicity and racial discrimination as the crucial factors affecting their chances in the labour market despite their possession of good qualifications.

Certain similarities may be noted between ethnic minorities and refugees in Scotland. Both groups tend to suffer from higher rates of unemployment, poor access to employment and difficulty in getting their foreign qualifications recognised. A study of refugees in Strathclyde substantiates these assertions. It found that occupations were not commensurate with qualifications and previous work experience, with the result that many refugees had become downwardly mobile, and more disturbingly, some were now amongst the long-term unemployed. (McFarland & Walsh 1988). It is assumed by some that ethnic minority individuals and refugees have unrealistic expectations in relation to their careers but McFarland and Walsh found that this was not the case.

Housing and Health...

The review thus far has focussed mainly on 'absolute' issues regarding poverty, but as mentioned earlier, poverty is also often experienced in terms of having limited access to acceptable standards of living. We will now focus on two main dimensions in this regard; housing and health.

Housing...

Over the last decade, the general living conditions and housing needs of ethnic minorities in Scotland have been well documented by various housing researchers (Dalton and Daghlian 1989, Bowes at al 1989, SEMRU 1993a, Dalton and Hampton 1995). Despite the numerous fact finding exercises in the past, agencies have failed to take effective action to change the living circumstances of most ethnic minority families in Glasgow, as a result the housing expectations and living conditions of many participants remain low (Dalton and Hampton 1995). Dalton and Hampton conclude that their findings in Govanhill mirrors the overall unmet housing needs in Glasgow, and that some of the housing experiences and aspirations that emerged during their survey (household structure, living arrangements, overcrowding, poor housing conditions and slow response to requests for rehousing) are issues to be considered when planning for this group.

Location and tenure...

In the Strathclyde region housing policies have to some extent, affected ethnic minority patterns of residence in the area. Some researchers argue that institutional and overt racism has led to ethnic minority communities being segregated in areas with poor quality housing. Most of the ethnic minority communities in Strathclyde tend to cluster around the inner city areas such as Woodlands, Govanhill, Garnethill and Pollokshields. The majority of dwellings in these areas , although owned, were built prior to World War One and are now in a state of decay and disrepair. Dalton and Daghlian (1989) concur that most ethnic communities have bought at the bottom end of the housing market. Bailey et al (1994) support this claim, pointing out that due to the inaccessibility to much of Scotland's housing stock, most ethnic minorities are segregated in poor quality, inner city accommodation.

Access to housing influences the tenure, locality and quality of ethnic minority housing choices. Dalton and Hampton (1995) concur: **"...for some... the housing market is perceived through a jaundiced lens reflecting bitter experience. Others appeared not fully to understand the procedures involved in getting a house. All the participants felt that getting a house was much more difficult if one were of ethnic origin...".** In the same study, language was frequently mentioned as a major problem in terms of access to available printed material and the major concern for most participants appeared to be the fact that they did not know who to approach officially, when they needed advice, information or assistance as regards housing and related matters. The majority of the respondents in this study perceived the housing providers to be more accessible to the white community than to themselves.

Many studies have produced evidence to support a generalised assertion that ethnic minority groups in the United Kingdom are restricted in their choice of housing (SEMRU 1993b), through discriminatory housing policies and interlinked factors like unemployment and low pay. From the late 1970s the Conservative government has promoted the notion of society being based on home-ownership. This, however, is not necessarily an indicator of prosperity but rather serves as a method of segregating certain groups into poorer quality housing units.

It is maintained in a SEMRU report (1993b) that the issue of choice of housing and tenure is a complex one, **"...if ethnic minority groups have limited access to council housing , their choice of owner -occupation is necessarily qualified...it is also evident that minority ethnic groups experience worse housing conditions in**

the owner-occupied section and therefore a probability that they require to spend more on repair and maintenance..." . Dalton and Daghlian (1989) concur that owner occupation is not necessarily equated to good housing conditions. In their study they found that the majority of ethnic minority households were found to be living in property which was purchased for under £10 000. They add **"... many of these properties were suffering from structural problems and lack of amenities, and in some cases therefore housing conditions were extremely poor, with owners unable to finance repairs..."** .

In Glasgow, the Pakistani population are more likely to be home owners (Dalton and Daghlian 1989) while Chinese show a preference to rent from local authorities or the private sector (Bailey at al 1994). Amin and Oppenheim (1992) conclude that tenure is thus not always an accurate guide to housing conditions, as there are usually important differences of quality and standards within the same tenure. They maintain that owner occupied housing in the suburbs are different in terms of quality from those found in most inner city areas.

Overcrowding...

Another factor to be considered alongside tenure is the size of ethnic minority families and matters relating to overcrowding. A study conducted by the Scottish Office in 1990 concurs that although many ethnic minority families had owned their home, and on average owned larger properties, this was offset by the fact that the families were larger (average household size: 4.6) than white households (average household size: 2.4) and thus were more likely to be living in overcrowded conditions, especially in the case of those of Pakistani origin (Smith 1990). Household size and tenure are variable between ethnic minorities. For example the Chinese compared with the Pakistani population have smaller and fewer extended families, though their average household size is still slightly larger than that of white. (Bailey et al 1994).

The larger size of certain ethnic minority families (mainly Pakistani) has a crucial impact on living standards, increasing the risk of poverty (Save the children 1994). Norris (1977) maintained that when overcrowding is utilised as an indicator of poverty then the picture in Strathclyde is bleak, with the area having twice the proportion of its residents living in overcrowded conditions.

More recently, Dalton and Hampton (1995) note that overcrowding is still a feature of daily life for many ethnic minority families in Glasgow.They found that 18.2% of ethnic households in Glasgow city were overcrowded. More specifically, it was found that in Govanhill, an area of high Pakistani

concentration, approximately (22.7%), ethnic minority households were overcrowded. This led the authors to conclude that a significant number of large, mainly Pakistani families, were living in overcrowded circumstances. Dalton and Daghlian (1989) also found in their study that the problem of over occupation was most severe and the most extreme example quoted by them was a muslim family with more than 7 members living in only 2 rooms and a further 13 families of similar size crowded into flats of 3 rooms.

In a recent study in Govanhill, similar patterns of overcrowding were noted (Dalton and Hampton 1995). They comment: " **...issues of size and structure were common place in our discussions. Overcrowding reflected in part extended families living within the same accommodation. One family interviewed had 10 people occupying a flat and represented an extreme case of overcrowding; indeed this particular case was highlighted further by the fact that the largest flat in the survey was 4 apartment all of which featured as bedrooms as well as for other purposes...**". Similar trends are noted by Bailey et al (1990) who also found the Pakistani (11.2%) households in Glasgow to be more overcrowded than the Chinese (3.40%) and Indian (3.36%).

Poor living conditions...

In this regard, Dalton and Daghlian (1989) found that many of those in overcrowded houses experienced a low quality of life with a quarter of the respondents in their study indicating that they were forced to use their kitchens as bedrooms and living rooms. Similar trends were noted by Dalton and Hampton (1995) where most households in Govanhill indicated that household rooms were used for dual purposes. Some respondents in the study indicated that this situation had resulted in a low quality of life and many were depressed about the inadequate and poor condition of their dwellings. In many cases, this was compounded by the stress of not being able to obtain better housing and leading to an increase in family breakdowns.

In another housing study in Glasgow, Dalton & Daghlian (1989) discovered that at least two hundred and ten ethnic minority households were living in older properties in Charing Cross, Garnethill, Pollokshields and Govanhill. Many of these households were living in poor quality flats as a result of low income. An evaluation of indicators such as household size and facilities within these dwellings led the researchers to describe living circumstances of these families as **"...very poor..."**.

They discussed a range of factors that contributed to the poor living conditions.

For example, 85% of their sample did not have central heating. Only 1 in 4 stated that their present level of heating was adequate, with 3% heating only the main living area. Also, a significant number (39%) indicated that their homes needed repairs, ranging from rotting window frames to external structural problems. 24.4% stated that they were unable to pay for these repairs to be carried out. A recent in-depth housing study of ethnic minorities in Govanhill mirrored the findings of earlier studies. A variety of structural concerns were highlighted such as, burst pipes and windows needing fixed, outside railings and stairways being in poor condition, and dampness featured regularly. In one case study a woman of Pakistani origin, trying to escape racial abuse, was rehoused in a damp, cold flat.

It is also generally accepted that certain basic facilities, especially heating, are more expensive in Scotland than they are elsewhere in the UK, and that these basic facilities use up a significant proportion a families income. For poorer households nearly 50% of their income is taken up on housing, fuel, light, power and food (Save the Children & GCU 1995). In turn, this leaves little if any, disposable income for other essentials such as education, recreation and leisure thus those living in poor conditions are often unable to participate in many social activities, that are considered by many, as part of their day-to-day lives.

Similar housing experiences were documented for refugees in Strathclyde, by McFarland and Walsh (1988). They claimed that refugees in Strathclyde are often allocated 'Hard to Let' properties. With poor employment prospects most refugees are forced to remain trapped in low quality housing in deprived areas. A quote from that study highlights the conditions that some of the refugees were faced with:

> **"We were given a house in Renton. It had been burnt. The windows were boarded up, the walls were black. They were still wet from when the fire had been put out. It took us seven years to get away from that place."**

Homelessness...

Murie (1988 in SEMRU 1993b) has attributed the rise of homelessness to certain fundamental changes in the organisation of housing systems. He maintains that: **"... the more recent decline of council rented stock together with the rising costs of home ownership and the growing socio-economic inequalities in British society in the past ten years or so have individually or cumulatively exacerbated the incidence of homelessness...**". Research confirms that homelessness

predominates in the inner city areas and that it affects those who are most marginalised in the labour market and those least able to find a safety net in the welfare state (SEMRU, 1993b). SEMRU (1993a) mentions various researchers who found that ethnic minority groups are disproportionately at risk from homelessness.

Notwithstanding this, the actual extent of homelessness amongst ethnic minority communities in Glasgow remains unknown and indeed, difficult to assess. In a study carried out in Govanhill, Dalton & Hampton (1995) discovered that although at least 40% of their sample had considered themselves to be homeless at some point in their lives, many explained that they were never really 'on the streets' as friends and relatives had stepped in to assist. The respondents explained that it was part of their culture to shelter a friend or relative on a temporary basis, until they are able to find a home of their own. Although some of the respondents who were sharing with relatives and friends at the time had defined themselves as essentially homeless, a view not shared by the authorities. The authors point to the confusion arising around the definition of homelessness, with ethnic minorities having a different view from that of the authorities. The authors concur, **"in this regard, the actual extent of homelessness would therefore appear to be somewhat shadowed".**

Racial abuse...

Pacione (1989) maintains that multiple deprivation is characterised by the spatial coincidence of social, economic and environmental disadvantages. While poor housing in inner city areas has obvious effects on personal well-being, ethnic minority communities have the added burden of living in neighborhoods that are less than friendly, thus experiencing high levels of isolation, discrimination and racial harassment.

The quality of life experienced by ethnic minority households in all tenure groups must to some extent be affected by racial harassment. In a study of racial harassment in Glasgow, Walsh (1987) found direct evidence of racially motivated abuse which had a demeaning influence on the lives of Glasgow's ethnic minority communities. Harassment was portrayed in a number of ways from burning rags being put through letter boxes, houses and cars being attacked, obscene telephone calls, and in some cases physical attack.

The widespread experience of harassment and the nature of the accounts of harassment sharpen the attitudes of households to certain housing situations. The preference for housing in areas close to places of work, worship, schools and shops relates partly to experiences and expectations of harassment (SEMRU

1993b).

The attitude to some peripheral estates and other estates with bad reputations relate strongly to experience of harassment. The risk of violence for women, children, or when returning late from work in central city locations is referred to in many cases and affects decisions about children's play, going out, visiting, or being visited. One response is to prefer housing very close to other members of the family or where households from minority ethnic groups or the same community also live (SEMRU 1993b).

Another example of reduced quality of life is illustrated by Avan (1994) who indicates in her study that the women (all ethnic) in her sample **"expressed very real fear of racial harassment and abuse and as a result they felt trapped and confined to their house. The women found this enforced confinement especially frustrating and stressful because the style and layout of houses in Glasgow is more restrictive than their countries of origin..."**

The shortage of larger properties consequently has particularly severe implications for some minority ethnic groups. Similarly, the use of allocation schemes or points schemes which do not give real priority to overcrowding appear as discriminatory to households from minority ethnic groups.

Again, refugees in Strathclyde share similar experiences. McFarland & Walsh (1988) point out that many refugees in Strathclyde are also subjected to a daily diet of racist abuse; a feature of their day-to-day lives. 40% of their sample experienced verbal abuse, and were afraid to discuss this in a wider context in case they were seen as being ungrateful yet they were very appreciative of being in Scotland. Many refugees spoke of 'nightmare' experiences which was having a debilitating affect on their lives, especially in the Glasgow area.

Dalton and Daghlian (1989) conclude that racism and racial harassment is a social evil which needs to be tackled and eradicated. They add **"...for social housing managers, racial harassment is clearly an issue which must be addressed within the framework of property management policies..."**

Health...

"...the penalties for being poor are severe. Compared to others in society, the poor person generally lives less long, has more frequent illnesses, more physical and mental defects and experiences more personal crises..." (Clinard 1974)

The relationship between health and poverty has been well documented by many researchers in Britain (Ahmad 1993, Amin and Oppenheim 1992, Payne 1991, Avan 1994, Poverty Alliance 1994). Ahmad (1992) asserts that health is fundamentally located in the socio-economic and environmental context of peoples lives and that poverty is the single most important determinant of ill-health. In this regard he comments: **"... struggles for better health are therefore essentially struggles for better jobs, adequate housing, access to education, a safe environment, good public facilities and civil and legal rights..."** Ahmad concludes that Britain's black populations are particularly poorly served by the health and welfare services.

Although the effects of limited access to health services, inappropriate services and lack of services for ethnic minorities have been well debated in England, by comparison these issues have remained submerged in Scotland. Poverty and limited access to services can affect both the physical and mental well being of a person, resulting in a reduced quality of life. Payne (1991) concurs that people in lower occupational groups are more likely to die prematurely and to experience poor health during their lifetime as are their children.

The Director of Public Health (Greater Glasgow Health Board) in an annual report (1991/1992) concurs that material deprivation is positively associated with ill health, poor psycho-social health and decreased fitness. The report also points out that health in Glasgow city is generally poor relative to the rest of Scotland and mentions two main reasons in this regard: the concentration of socio-economic deprivation within the city which is much greater than elsewhere; and the degree of disadvantage which is also greater than elsewhere in Scotland. In particular, the report concludes that poverty and poor housing are the main components of socio-economic disadvantage in Glasgow and suggests that unless these problems are addressed, it will be difficult to improve the physical and mental well being of people.

Provision of health services...

The limited provision made for ethnic minority communities by local social services departments and health providers has been a matter of long-standing concern to the CRE. Fenton and Sadiq (1993) maintain that the needs of small, localised ethnic minority communities are no less important than those of the majority population.

Much of the recent studies in the area of ethnic minority health have focussed mainly on service provision and its' appropriateness. Various researchers have

concluded that current services are neither appropriate nor culturally sensitive to the specialised needs of ethnic minority communities in Britain. (Webb-Johnson 1991, Beliappa 1991, Karmi 1993, Bowes 1993, Wilson 1993). Referring to mental health services in particular, Wilson (1993) contends that minorities who suffer from mental illness are often **"... over-, under- or mis- diagnosed" and that "...care is undertaken with a eurocentric bias which often leads to ineffective and culturally insensitive treatment...".**

Webb-Johnson argues similarly, indicating that psychiatric services have failed to respond to the needs and to secure the confidence of Britains' ethnic communities. She asserts that services are often discriminatory, culturally insensitive and inappropriate and that consultation with the ethnic communities about planning and delivery of services has been sadly lacking. Webb-Johnson contends that services for the ethnic communities should be part of the mainstream provision and that the relevance and appropriateness of the current services must be questioned and addressed. She believes that in order to provide quality services which are appropriate, senior management and staff must be committed to develop their services to meet the needs of the minority communities.

The work of Karmi (1993) demonstrates that the most powerful determinants of inequality in health care relates to ignorance of different cultures on the part of doctors and nurses, a lack of appropriate staff training, lack of appropriate information, as well as racism and discrimination. Bowes (1993) also found that ethnic minority women's experiences of health care were demeaned by a lack of cultural awareness by general practitioners, a lack of relevant materials in appropriate languages, and lack of counselling facilities to address the needs and concerns of ethnic minority communities.

In a more recent study carried out by Avan (1994) the issue of communication as a barrier to accessing health services was once again established. Avan asserts **"... in areas such as health care, effective communication is of utmost importance, yet many respondents felt that this was lacking..."** Avan comments further that ethnic minority communities feel it necessary to be accompanied by a third party, either a friend, relative or child and that the presence of this third party often compromises privacy and anonymity. In a general survey carried out by the Scottish office, almost all (99%) of ethnic minority respondents were found to be registered with a general practitioner but it was found also that nearly everybody interviewed had experienced difficulties in obtaining information and communicating with their doctors or with hospital staff

Liao (1994) also established a link between poor uptake of health services amongst Chinese people and language and communication difficulties. Indeed Liao found that many of those interviewed (17%) had consulted private Chinese-speaking doctors and some (6%) even flew back to Hong Kong to seek treatment.

Failure to recognise the specialised needs of the ethnic community in terms of health service provision often results in poor uptake of services and consequently a reduced quality of life for most ethnic minorities in Scotland.

Health conditions...

Studies relating to the health conditions (both physical and mental) of ethnic minorities in Scotland remain sketchy since most health researchers have concentrated mainly on access to service provision and the appropriateness of those services. Nonetheless, the researchers attempted to piece together certain information regarding the nature of illnesses suffered by ethnic minority communities, from various pieces of research related to ethnic minority communities in Scotland.

Studies carried out in Scotland and elsewhere in Great Britain indicate that ethnic minority communities are at greater risk from coronary heart disease, diabetes, high blood pressure, strokes and schizophrenia (Scottish Office 1995). Avan (1994) concurs that studies of mortality statistics have confirmed an excess of coronary heart disease in immigrants from the Indian subcontinent. She adds **"...mortality from this cause in 1979-1983 was 36% higher in Asian men and 46% higher in Asian women than the indigenous population...".** Avan also found that Asian women living in the west of Scotland have a significantly higher rate of cervical cancer when compared with the white population.

In another study, McFarland et al (1987) noted that in the East Pollokshields area the health standards of ethnic minority women and their children gave the doctors and health visitors cause for concern, with the local hospital having greater rates of peri-natal mortality than other hospitals in the city. More recently, Pershad & Tyrell (1995) also discovered that peri-natal mortality rates amongst ethnic minority women, particularly Pakistanis, were significantly higher than that of white women.

They comment **"...while the trend is for overall rates of peri-natal mortality to**

have improved, there remains a disturbingly high excess of between 50% and 80% in the rates of infants born to Black and ethnic minority rates in the UK, the worst rates being experienced by Pakistani communities..." The authors believe that poverty is likely to play a significant role in contributing to these high peri-natal mortality rates. They assert that black and ethnic minority babies have a poorer start to life and that poor nutrition, poor housing and diminished access to services are more likely to affect ethnic minority mothers, than the white.

Liao (1994) also found the health status of the Chinese residents in Glasgow to be poor when compared to the rest of local population. In particular the Chinese elderly were found to have higher rates of long term illnesses and feeling of depression. The author linked these factors to immigration and the long working hours that most Chinese people endure.

Although, based on housing needs the Dalton & Hampton study (1995) uncovered a number of health conditions which were intrinsically linked with their housing conditions. A significant proportion of their sample albeit small (75%) had indicated that at least one person in their household had some form of disability or infirmity. A range of medical and mental health problems were mentioned. These included: **"...heart trouble, high blood pressure, TB, asthma, diabetes and blood disorders, paralysis, spina bifida and eye or hearing problems..."**

Problems related to mental health also emerged in the Dalton and Hampton study and these included mainly **"... stress, depression, tension and nerves..."**. There is little doubt that effects of poor living conditions, low paid jobs, unemployment and limited access to services impact greatly on the mental state of ethnic minority communities in Scotland. Many of the participants in the Dalton and Hampton study had linked their mental state to their current overcrowded and sub-standard living conditions. For example, a community worker who was interviewed during the survey commented that although her job related mainly to mental health, almost half her workload involved assisting clients with their housing problems. She concluded that housing problems, to a large extent, contributed to mental stress and distress among ethnic minority communities in Glasgow.

The Chief Executive (1995: Strathclyde regional Council) concurs that with regard to ethnic minorities, particular patterns of disease are predominantly related to housing conditions, employment or its lack, urban overcrowding and an awareness or availablilty of medical care.

Section Three : Concluding remarks...

It has been well established that poverty is not just about money and that any valid analysis of poverty and ethnic minorities must be considered within the context of the social, economic and political circumstances that surround these communities. (Amin and Oppenheim 1992, Ahmad 1992, Pacione 1989). The researchers therefore contend that any initiative aimed at evaluating the nature and extent of poverty amongst ethnic minorities in Scotland must adopt holistic approaches since the background of these people have a significant impact on their quality of life.

In the absence of concise and co-ordinated information regarding ethnic minorities and poverty in Scotland, this review serves to provide some indicators that may facilitate a better understanding of the experiences and current living circumstances of these communities. In Scotland, although the absolute indicators of poverty (mainly income and employment) remain limited mainly to the 1991 census information by comparison, certain relative aspects have been well documented by many researchers during the last decade, albeit indirectly.

In this regard, the poor living conditions of ethnic minorities, especially housing, have long been exposed yet efforts to change these have, at least been slow. By comparison, relatively less evidence relating to the actual nature and extent of ethnic health circumstance have been documented in Scotland. Nonetheless, in recent years, many organisations recognising the need for focussed and in-depth work in this area, have initiated various projects relating to both physical and mental ethnic health in Glasgow. These include: the Ethnic Minority Mental Health project (Glasgow Association For Mental Health), Ethnic minority Link Worker Project (Glasgow Healthy City Project), Training Ethnic Minority Health Education Workers (Health education Board for Scotland and Greater Glasgow Health Board).

Despite the fact that this review did not uncover specific information and details relating to poverty in terms of location (actual areas within the region), ethnic groups (differences/similarities), gender and age, it did nonetheless provide useful indicators that show a reduced quality of life for most ethnic minorities in Strathclyde. Given that poverty and deprivation are closely related to quality of life, the evidence in this report would suggest that there is a widespread incidence of poverty amongst ethnic minority communities in Scotland and especially, in Strathclyde.

Key observations...

More specifically the main observations arising from the review are summarised:

- The general focus of most literature on poverty in Scotland has been colour-blind and as a result the exact nature and extent of poverty amongst Scotland's ethnic minority communities remains unclear.

- It was generally agreed by most researchers that the relative definitions of poverty are more relevant in terms of evaluating the ethnic minority communities since it allowed not only for the inclusion of income, but also for other significant social and cultural factors.

- It has been established that, in Scotland, limited understanding of race relations and the lack of knowledge of ethnic minority communities' social, cultural and economic requirements has led to a negative quality of life for many ethnic minority communities. A number of local studies have produced ample evidence to support this notion.

- Studies both in Scotland and England have shown that members of ethnic minority communities are more likely than their white counterparts to experience unemployment, low pay and reduced benefit uptake. Given that these factors are directly linked to poverty, ethnic minority groups appear more vulnerable in this regard.

- In Strathclyde the unemployment rate for ethnic minority communities (16.89%) is notably higher than that of the white population (13.33%), with the Pakistani population being more likely to be unemployed.

- In addition to the high rates of unemployment, it was also revealed that ethnic minorities are more likely to be employed in low paid work. The nature of this work often tends to be part-time work and excludes contributory benefits such as sick pay and pension schemes.

- Given their limited access to the labour market, many ethnic minority families are forced into self-employment, mainly in the catering and retail industries. The review has shown that this is not necessarily a sign of affluence or prosperity but may in fact disguise poverty within ethnic minority communities.

- It was found that various factors affect ethnic minorities in terms of welfare benefit claims. These included cultural factors, immigration laws, employment patterns, and discrimination. In this regard, under-claiming and non-claiming were mentioned as factors that contributed to deprivation.

- Despite their strong comittment to higher education, it was found that ethnic minority communities face a number of barriers in terms of accessing higher and further education. Moreover it was found that higher education qualifications do not necessarily give ethnic minority people the same advantages as their white counterparts in the labour market.

- Although a number of studies in Scotland have documented the specific housing needs and poor living conditions of local ethnic minority communities, very little effective action has been taken to improve the situation and as a result housing conditions and expectations remain low within ethnic communities.

- Ethnic minority communities are generally located in inner city areas with poor quality housing and although home-ownership is high amongst ethnic minority communities this is not necessarily a sign of affluence. Many families live in old buildings, requiring structural repairs which they cannot afford to undertake.

- Access to alternative housing is limited for many, by various factors, including discriminatory housing policies, unemployment, low pay and a lack of knowledge of services.

- The larger family size of ethnic minority communities, particularly the Pakistani population, increases the risk of poverty and overcrowding.

- In addition to poor housing conditions, the quality of life of many ethnic minority families is affected by isolation, discrimination and racial harassment in certain neighborhoods.

- The relationship between health (both mental and physical) and poverty has been well documented, yet work relating to ethnicity is limited, especially in Scotland.

- Various local studies had indicated that ethnic minority communities experience difficulties in accessing health services and that these services are inappropriate and insensitive to the specialised needs of

ethnic communities. The failure to recognise the specialised needs of ethnic minority communities has resulted in a poor up take of services, and therefore a reduced quality of life for many members of ethnic minority communities in Scotland.

- In terms of physical health, people from ethnic minority communities appear to be more susceptible to coronary heart disease, diabetes, high blood pressure, strokes and schizophrenia. Further it was noted that ethnic minority babies have a poorer start in life than white babies, due to social and economic exclusion.

- Similarities were noted in the living experiences of the refugees in Strathclyde and that of the ethnic minority communities; both the communities appear to face problems in terms of accessing reasonable employment, education, housing and health care.

Suggestions for future developmental work...

In the light of the above findings and considering the numerous gaps identified in the material consulted during this review, the researchers contend that issues relating to poverty and ethnic minorities need to be explored further, and in depth. The successful development of initiatives and strategies to counteract poverty within ethnic minority communities depend largely on accurate and concise information relating to these communities. In the absence of such knowledge, any anti- poverty initiative or strategy is bound to be limited in terms of meeting the needs of the ethnic communities in Scotland.

As argued throughout this report, poverty is multi-faceted and complex and as such special care must be taken to ensure that appropriate approaches are adopted when evaluating poverty issues and the extent of poverty in ethnic minority communities. More specifically, it was noticed during the review that many fundamental and basic issues relating to ethnic minority poverty in Scotland were not yet fully established. As a result anti-poverty strategies and initiatives aimed primarily at alleviating poverty in ethnic communities were not visible.

Areas within poverty that require special attention and in-depth analysis include; the exact nature and extent of poverty among ethnic minority communities in Strathclyde, and indeed Scotland; and significant issues relating to ethnicity, gender, social class, age, location and specific areas of need. In this regard, action orientated, empirical research exercises, based on qualitative methodologies are suggested.

Since poverty is essentially a relative concept, the researchers feel that any work undertaken on ethnic poverty must include the perspectives of the ethnic communities. Ideally, poverty research should be defined and measured in terms of the communities' perspective. In this regard, consultation with ethnic communities is critical in terms of planning research exercises and determining anti-poverty strategies. It is therefore suggested that members of the ethnic minority communities be included in the future planning of any initiatives.

Bibliography

Ahmad, WIU (ed) (1992): *The Politics of 'Race' and Health,* The Race Relations Unit, Bradford and Ilkley Community College.

Ahmad, WIU (ed) (1993): *Race and Health in Contemporary Britain,* Open University Press.

Amin, K and Oppenheim, C (1992): *Poverty in Black and White, Deprivation and Ethnic Minorities,* The Runnymede Trust and CPAG Ltd.

Avan, G (1994): *Perceived Health Needs of Black and Ethnic Minority Women, An Exploratory Study,* Glasgow Healthy City Project.

Bailey, N and Bowes, A and Sim, D (1994): The Chinese Community in Scotland, *Scottish Geographical Magazine,* Vol. 110, No. 2, pp.65-75.

Beliappa, J (1991): *Illness or Distress: Alternative Models of Mental Health,* Confederation of Indian Organisations.

Bird, J and Yee, WC and Myler, A (1988): *Widening Access to Higher Education for Black People,* Employment Department.

Bowes, A (1993): South Asian Women and Health Services: a study in Glasgow, *New Community,* Vol. 19, No. 4, pp.611.

Bowes, A and McCluskey, J and Sim, D (1989): *Ethnic Minority Housing Problems in Glasgow,* A Report to Glasgow District Council, University of Stirling.

Brennan, J and McGeever, P (1990): *Ethnic Minorities and the Graduate Labour Market,* CRE.

Brown, G and Cook, R (1983): *Scotland, The Real Divide, Poverty and Deprivation in Scotland,* Mainstream Publishing.

Clinard, MB (1974): *Sociology of Deviant Behaviour (4th Ed),* Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Craig, G (1994): *Poverty and Anti-Poverty Work in Scotland,* Scottish Anti-Poverty Network.

CRE (1987): *Chartered Accountancy Training Contracts: Report of a Formal Investigation into Ethnic Minority Recruitment,* CRE.

CRE (1988): *Report of a Formal Investigation into St.Georges Hospital Medical School,* CRE.

CRE (1992): *Submission to the National Commission on Education,* CRE.

Dalton, M and Daghlian, S (1989): *Barriers to Access: Black Applicants and Housing Association Tenure,* SEMRU Research Paper No. 9, Glasgow Caledonian University.

Dalton, M and Hampton, K (1995): *Housing Needs of Ethnic Minorities in Govanhill, A Community Perspective,* SEMRU Research Paper: Forthcoming Publication.

Fenton, S and Sadiq, A (1993): *The Sorrow in my Heart,* CRE.

Geddes, M (1995): *Poverty, Excluded Communities and Local Democracy,* Commission for Local Democracy.

Glasgow District Council (1992): *Anti-Poverty Strategy,* Glasgow.

Greater Glasgow Health Board (1991/2): *The Annual Report of the Director of Public Health,* GGHB.

Households Below Average Income (1983): *Households Below Average Income 1979-1990,* HMSO.

Karmi, G (1993): Equity and the Health of Ethnic Minorities, *Quality in Health Care,* No. 2, pp 100.

Knox, A and Siann, G (1994): *Influences on Career Choice: The Responses of Ethnic Minority and Ethnic Majority Girls,* SEMRU Research Paper No. 11, Glasgow Caledonian University.

Lampman, R J (1971): *Ends and Means of Reducing Income Poverty,* Institute for Research On Poverty, University of Wisconsin

Liao, XH (1994): *Health Status and Health Needs of the Chinese Population in Glasgow,* Dept. of Public Health, GGHB.

McFarland, E and Dalton, M and Walsh, D (1987): *Personal Welfare Services and Ethnic Minorities,* SEMRU Research Paper No. 4, Glasgow Caledonian University.

McFarland, E and Walsh, D (1988): *Refugees in Strathclyde,* SEMRU Research Paper No. 6, Glasgow Caledonian University.

McFarland, E and Walsh, D (1989): *Ethnic Minority Youth in Woodlands: Present Aspirations, Future Opportunities,* SEMRU, Glasgow Caledonian University.

Norris, G (1977): *Poverty, The Facts in Scotland,* Poverty Action Group.

Pacione, M (1989): The Urban Crisis: Poverty and Deprivation in the Scottish City, *Scottish Geographical Magazine,* Vol.10, pp.101-115.

Panesar, J (1995): *Widening Participation in Education and Training for Asian Women and Girls,* Conference Paper, University of East London.

Payne, S (1991): *Women, Health and Poverty: an Introduction,* Harvester Wheatsheaf.

Pearson, R, et al (1989): *How many Graduates in the 21st Century? The Choice is Yours,* IMS Report, No. 177.

Pershad, P and Tyrell, H (1995): *Access to Antenatal and Postnatal Services for Asian Women living in East Pollokshields,* Save the Children.

Ridley, J and Kendrick, A (1994): *"Is Scotland Colour Blind?" 'Race' and Research in Scotland,* Seminar Series No. 5, Social Services Research Group, Scottish Branch.

Save the Children (1994): *Poverty Briefing,* Child Poverty Resource Unit, Save the Children.

Save the Children & GCU (1995): *Child and Family Poverty in Scotland: the Facts,* Save the Children and Glasgow Caledonian University.

Scottish Office (1995): *Access to Health Care by the Ethnic Minority Communities, A Guide to Good Practice,* HMSO.

SEMRU (1993a): *The Experience of Households from Minority Ethnic Groups in the Scottish Housing System*, SEMRU/ School of Planning and Housing, Edinburgh College of Art/ Herriot Watt University.

SEMRU (1993b): *'Race' and Housing in Scotland: A Literature Review and Bibliography*, SEMRU, Edinburgh College of Art/Herriot Watt University.

Sly, F (1994): Ethnic Groups and the Labour Market, *Employment Gazette*, Vol. 102, No. 5, pp.147-159.

Smith, P (1990): *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland*, Scottish Office.

Social Policy Research Unit, Leeds (1994): *Findings, The Provision of Social Security Benefits to Minority Ethnic Communities*, No. 59, Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Strathclyde Poverty Alliance (1992): *Poverty in Strathclyde*, SPA.

Strathclyde Poverty Alliance (1994): *Race and Poverty, Issues and Opportunities for Action in Strathclyde*, Preliminary Draft Report.

Strathclyde Regional Council (1990): *Strathclyde Anti-Poverty Strategy and Initiatives for 1990/1*, Glasgow.

Strathclyde Regional Council (1995): *Strathclyde Social Trends, A Report by the Chief Executive*, No. 4, Glasgow.

STUC (1992): *Unemployment: The Race Bias in Scotland*, STUC Report.

Vellins, S (1982): South Asian Students in British Universities: A Statistical Note, *New Community*, Vol. X, No. 2, pp. 206-212.

Walsh, D (1987): *Racial Harassment in Glasgow*, SEMRU Research Paper No. 3, Glasgow Caledonian University.

Webb-Johnson, A (1991): *A Cry for Change: An Asian Perspective on Developing Quality Mental Health Care*, Confederation of Indian Organisations (UK).

Wilson, M (1993): *Mental Health and Britain's Black Communities, Mental Health Task Force*, Kings Fund Centre.

PUBLICATIONS

Register of Research 1986, (M MacEwen, Edinburgh).
A register of research undertaken on race relations and minorities in Scotland, £4.

"Racial Harassment, Council Housing and the Law",
1986, (M. MacEwen, Edinburgh), Research Discussion Paper, No. 1, £3.

"Personal Welfare Services",
1987, (E. McFarland/M. Dalton & D. Walsh, Glasgow), Research/Discussion Paper No. 4, £3.

"Housing Allocations, Race and Law",
1987, (M. MacEwen, Edinburgh), Research/Discussion Paper No. 2, £3.

"Racial Harassment in Glasgow",
1987, (D. Walsh, Glasgow), Research Discussion Paper No. 3, £3.

"Ethnic Minorities Profile: a Study of Needs and Services in Lothian Regional and Edinburgh District",
1987, (M. MacEwen et al, Edinburgh). Report commissioned and sponsored by Lothian Regional Council and Edinburgh District Council - 3 volumes, £14 total.

"Community Relations Councils: Scotch Mist, Domestic Colonialism or What?", 1988, (M. Macewen, Edinburgh), Research/Discussion Paper No. 5, £3.

"Refugees in Strathclyde",
1988, (McFarland/Walsh, Glasgow). £3.

"Ethnic Minority Youth: Present Aspirations, Future Opportunities",
1989,)E. McFarland, D. Walsh, Glasgow), £3.

"Parents, Careers and Culture: The Views of Muslim Girls:,
1989, (G. Siann, Glasgow), Research Paper No. 8, £2.

"Minority Policies in the United Kingdom",
1989, (E. McFarland and D. Walsh, Glasgow), £2.

"Barriers to Access: Black Applicants and Housing Association Tenure",
1990, (M. Dalton, S. Daghlian, Glasgow), Research Paper No. 9, £2.50.

"Vis-a-vis Visas",
1989, (M. MacEwen, Edinburgh), Paper No. 30, £3.

"Public Housing and Ethnic Minorities in Edinburgh",
(Hancock, D. & MacEwen, M., Edinburgh), 1989, £5.

"Fair Housing: Lessons from the USA?",
1990, (M. MacEwen, Edinburgh), Research Paper No. 10,
£3.

"Ethnic Minority Girls and Career Choice",
1990 (G. Siann, Glasgow), Research Paper No. 11, £2.50.

"Planning & Ethnic Minority Settlement in Europe: The Myth of Thresholds of Tolerance",
1992, (Prior, A. & MacEwen, M., Edinburgh), £3.

"Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centres",
1992, (E McFarland and D Walsh, Glasgow),
£2.

"Bosnian Refugees in Glasgow",
1994, (E.W. McFarland, Glasgow), Research Paper No. 1, 2nd series,
£3.

"Refugees in Lothian: The Experiences and Aspirations of Refugees and Asylum Seekers in Lothian",
1994, (D. Walsh, E. McFarland, K. Hampton), Research Paper No. 2, 2nd series, £3.

NOTE:
REQUESTS FOR PUBLICATIONS SHOULD BE SENT TO THE APPROPRIATE ADDRESS (EITHER EDINBURGH OR GLASGOW) IN RESPECT OF EACH PUBLICATION LISTED.